Different Types of Ingroup Identification as a Function of Culture, Group Status, Attachment Style, and Group Type

Milen Toshev Milanov

MA (Psych)

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

October 2009
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis is the result of original research.

..........................
Milen Toshev Milanov
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present work was made possible with an International Postgraduate Research Scholarship and a University of Newcastle Postgraduate Research Scholarship. Studies 1 and 2 were additionally funded by a research grant from the John and Daphne Keats Endowment Research Fund.

I would like to express my profound gratitude to my primary supervisor, Dr Mark Rubin, for his guidance, immense support, constructive criticism, and infinite patience throughout all stages of this research. I would also like to thank my secondary supervisor, Dr Stefania Paolini, whose encouragement and valuable feedback on the drafts of this thesis were very helpful.

Finally, I would like to thank my wife Valentina and my two little girls Rosi and Iva who always managed to cheer me up somehow after the long days and nights of work on my PhD.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY .................................................................................. ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................. iii

TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................................................................. iv

LIST OF TABLES ......................................................................................................... viii

LIST OF FIGURES ......................................................................................................... ix

SYNOPSIS ........................................................................................................................ 1

CHAPTER ONE: LITERATURE REVIEW AND GENERAL INTRODUCTION ........... 2

   Overview ....................................................................................................................... 2

   A Literature Review of Models of Ingroup Identification ........................................ 2

      The Concept of Group Identification in Social Psychology Research .......... 2

      Distinguishing Five Key Types of Ingroup Identification in the Literature ...... 17

   A Theoretical Analysis of Centrality, Social, Communal, and Interdependent
     Identification ............................................................................................................... 21

      Centrality ................................................................................................................. 21

      Social Identification ................................................................................................ 22

      The Distinction Between Communal and Interdependent Identification ....... 23

      Communal Identification ....................................................................................... 25

      Interdependent Identification ............................................................................... 29

      Summarizing the Four Types of Ingroup Identification That I Investigate ...... 34

      Measuring the Four Different Types of Ingroup Identification ....................... 35

Different Types of Ingroup Identification as a Function of Culture, Gender, Ingroup
Status, Attachment Style, and Group Type ................................................................. 37

   Cross-Cultural Differences in Types of Ingroup Identification ......................... 37

   Gender Differences in Types of Ingroup Identification ....................................... 40

   Group Status and Different Types of Ingroup Identification ............................ 41

   Relationship Attachment Style and Different Types of Ingroup Identification ... 43

   Different Types of Groups and Different Types of Ingroup Identification .......... 46

   Summary of Hypotheses and Layout of the Present Work ......................................... 50

CHAPTER TWO: CONSTRUCTING THE CENTRALITY, SOCIAL, COMMUNAL,
AND INTERDEPENDENT IDENTIFICATION SCALE ............................................. 55

   Overview ..................................................................................................................... 55

   Introduction ............................................................................................................... 55

   Method ....................................................................................................................... 58

      Overview ................................................................................................................ 58

      Participants ............................................................................................................. 58

      Measures ............................................................................................................... 59

         The Centrality, Social, Communal and Interdependent Identification Scale ... 59

         Self-Construal Measures .................................................................................. 62

         Measures of Orientation Toward Relationships ............................................... 63

         Self-Esteem Measure ...................................................................................... 64

         Procedure .......................................................................................................... 64

   Results ....................................................................................................................... 66

      Factor Analysis and CSCIIS’s Psychometric Properties ................................. 66

      The Revised CSCIIS .......................................................................................... 70
The Balanced Inventory of Desirable Responding (BIDR) ........................................ 116
Measures of Identification Components ................................................................. 117
Measure of Relationship Attachment Style ............................................................ 117
Results ....................................................................................................................... 118
Factor Analysis ........................................................................................................ 118
Reliability and Interitem Correlations .................................................................... 121
Construct Validity ..................................................................................................... 123
Correlations Within the CSCIIS ............................................................................. 123
Correlations Between CSCIIS and Other Identification Subscales ....................... 123
Correlations Between the CSCIIS and BIDR .......................................................... 127
Gender and Cross-Cultural Variations in Types of Identification ......................... 127
Type of Group and Type of Identification .............................................................. 128
Attachment Style and Types of Identification ........................................................ 130
Discussion ............................................................................................................... 133
Validity of the Different Types of Ingroup Identification ...................................... 133
Gender and Cross-Cultural Variations in Types of Identification ......................... 134
Type of Group and Type of Identification .............................................................. 135
Type of Attachment Style as a Predictor of Type of Identification ....................... 136
Study Limitations ................................................................................................... 137
Summary ............................................................................................................... 138

CHAPTER FIVE: THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DIFFERENT TYPES OF GROUPS AND DIFFERENT TYPES OF INGROUP IDENTIFICATION .......... 140
Overview ................................................................................................................... 140
Introduction ............................................................................................................... 140
The Group Type Hypothesis .................................................................................... 140
Previous Studies ..................................................................................................... 145
The Present Research .............................................................................................. 145
Factor Structure of CSCIIS ..................................................................................... 146
Method ...................................................................................................................... 146
Participants .............................................................................................................. 146
Procedure and Measures ....................................................................................... 147
Results ....................................................................................................................... 148
Factor Analysis ........................................................................................................ 148
Reliability and Interitem Correlations .................................................................... 153
Gender Differences in Types of Identification ....................................................... 153
Testing the Group Type Hypothesis ....................................................................... 153
Discussion ............................................................................................................... 157
Factor Structure of the CSCIIS ............................................................................. 157
The Group Type Hypothesis .................................................................................... 158
Study Limitations ................................................................................................... 160
Summary ............................................................................................................... 161

CHAPTER SIX: DIFFERENT TYPES OF INGROUP IDENTIFICATION AS A FUNCTION OF SPECIFIC TYPES OF GROUPS ........................................ 162
Overview ................................................................................................................... 162
Introduction ............................................................................................................... 162
Previous Investigations of the Group Type Hypothesis ......................................... 162
Studies 1 and 3 ..................................................................................................... 162
Study 4 .............................................................................................................. 163
The Current Study ................................................................................................. 164
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Comparison Between Criterion Eigenvalues From Parallel Analysis and the Eigenvalues From the Current Principal Axis Factor Analysis (Study1) .................. 68
Table 2 Items and Factor Loadings of the CSCIIS After Item Reduction .................. 71
Table 3 Correlations Between Established Measures and CSCIIS’s Subscales ........... 73
Table 4 Correlations Between Different Types of Groups and Different Types of Ingroup Identification .................................................................................................................. 77
Table 5 Distribution of Western and non-Western Participants in Experimental Conditions Based on Each of the Cultural Items and the Index of Westernness ....... 91
Table 6 Comparison Between Criterion Eigenvalues From Parallel Analysis and the Eigenvalues From the Current Principal Axis Factoring (Study 2) ....................... 95
Table 7 Items and Factor Loadings of the 20-Item Version of CSCIIS ..................... 97
Table 8 Comparison Between Criterion Eigenvalues From Parallel Analysis and the Eigenvalues From the Current Principal Axis Factoring (Study 3) ....................... 120
Table 9 Items and Factor Loadings of the 20-Item Version of CSCIIS ..................... 122
Table 10 Correlations Between Types of Identification and Established Measures of Different Identification Constructs .................................................................................................................. 125
Table 11 Correlations Between Types of Groups and Types of Identification ......... 129
Table 12 Comparison Between Criterion Eigenvalues From Parallel Analysis and the Eigenvalues From the Current Principal Axis Factor Analysis .................. 150
Table 13 Items and Factor Loadings of the 20-Item Version of CSCIIS ..................... 152
Table 14 Comparison Between Criterion Eigenvalues From Parallel Analysis and the Eigenvalues From the Current Principal Axis Factor Analysis .................. 169
Table 15 Items and Factor Loadings of the 16-Item Version of CSCIIS ..................... 170
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Eigenvalues as a function of factors extracted from the CSCIIS (Study 1) .... 67
Figure 2. Eigenvalues as a function of factors extracted from the CSCIIS (Study 2) .... 94
Figure 3. Eigenvalues as a function of factors extracted from the CSCIIS (Study 3) .. 119
Figure 4. Differences in the mean scores on social identification as a function of attachment style ............................................................................................................ 131
Figure 5. Differences in the mean scores on communal identification as a function of attachment style ............................................................................................................ 132
Figure 6. Differences in the mean scores on interdependent identification as a function of attachment style ........................................................................................................ 133
Figure 7. Eigenvalues as a function of factors extracted from the CSCIIS (Study 4) .. 149
Figure 8. Differences in the mean scores of social identification as a function of group type ............................................................................................................................... 155
Figure 9. Differences in the mean scores on interdependent identification as a function of group type ................................................................................................................ 156
Figure 10. Differences in the mean scores on communal identification as a function of group type ................................................................................................................ 157
Figure 11. Eigenvalues as a function of factors extracted from the CSCIIS (Study 5) 168
Figure 12. Differences in the mean scores on communal identification as a function of broad group type. ............................................................................................................................... 172
Figure 13. Differences in the mean scores on centrality as a function of broad group type ............................................................................................................................... 173
Figure 14. Differences in the mean scores on communal identification as a function of specific group type ............................................................................................................................... 175
Figure 15. Differences in the mean scores on centrality as a function of specific group type ............................................................................................................................... 176
Figure 16. Differences in the mean scores on social identification as a function of specific group type ............................................................................................................................... 177
SYNOPSIS

The present work is a project in social psychology that looks at four different types of ingroup identification and investigates their possible variations as a function of defining personal characteristics and group-related phenomena. Five studies provide evidence for the validity of a qualitative distinction between centrality, social, communal, and interdependent identification and examine the way in which culture, gender, group status, relationship attachment style, and group type predicted each type of identification with groups. The research employs a multi-sample approach and combines correlational, experimental, and quasi-experimental designs. Research data was collected using purpose-built questionnaires that included a newly constructed Centrality, Social, Communal and Interdependent Identification Scale (CSCIIS) together with previously validated measures. Participants from Western and non-Western cultural backgrounds showed dispositional differences in their preferred type of identification, and differed in the extent to which their identification was focused on the group as a whole or on the individual group members. The studies integrate social identity theory, self-construal, and behavioural interdependence ideas, suggesting that there are some types of ingroup identification that are primarily based on interpersonal processes and relationships between group members. The leading themes are those of the conceptual complexity in assessing individuals’ identification with various social groups and the possibilities for deepening our understanding of the phenomenon by considering the key aspects that separate one type of ingroup identification from another. The results help bring clarity to a confusing literature dealing with ingroup identification and illustrate the value of a different level approach in the area.