Collaborative Teaching Partnerships:
Toward cycles for success in supporting new teachers

Jason David McGrath BA Dip. Ed.

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Education (Research), University of Newcastle, Australia

March 2012
Statement of Originality

The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

(Signed)
Acknowledgements

I am sincerely grateful for the support of my supervisor Professor Jennifer Gore. Her expertise, guidance with the research and empathy for life’s changes were greatly valued.

I wish to thank those involved in the study, including those who willingly trialled the CTPs and those who shared insights for the survey research.

I also wish to thank those who provided support for the conduct of the study, including practitioners at state, district and school levels; and academics and policy makers who shared insights into their education systems in various parts of the world, some of whom even took me into their homes as part of an overseas trip to extend my learning.

I acknowledge and thank Dr Max Smith for reviewing chapter four and providing advice about presentation of quantitative data related to my survey research.

Professional editor, Mark MacLean, provided copyediting and proofreading services, according to the guidelines laid out in the university-endorsed national guidelines, ‘The editing of research theses by professional editors’.

I thank my family, including those who have passed away since I started my study but supported the opportunities that come from education. I am also grateful for the support of my wife Sui-Linn and the joy that comes from my children Aggie, Amica and Emmeline.
Contents

Statement of Originality ............................................................................................................ ii
Acknowledgements.................................................................................................................. iii
Contents ..................................................................................................................................... iv
List of tables and figures .......................................................................................................... ix
List of short forms ..................................................................................................................... x
Abstract .................................................................................................................................... xi

Chapter One: Introduction ........................................................................................................1
The context for new teachers entering teaching ................................................................. 1
Introducing Collaborative Teaching Partnerships (CTPs) .................................................. 2
Research question ..................................................................................................................... 6
The significance of the research ............................................................................................. 6
Outline of remaining chapters ............................................................................................... 7

Chapter Two: Literature review ...............................................................................................9
Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 9
Contexts of teaching and the value of a collaborative response ........................................... 9
Importance of the first years of teaching .............................................................................. 18
Mentoring: strengths and weaknesses of existing approaches .............................................. 23
   Mentoring and mentees ......................................................................................................... 29
   Mentoring for mentors: what is in it for them? .................................................................... 33
   Mentoring and the organisation ........................................................................................... 41
Team teaching: current approaches and focuses ................................................................. 46
   Team teaching for mentoring .............................................................................................. 46
   Team teaching for other purposes ....................................................................................... 53
Summary: four theoretical propositions distilled from the review of the literature .............. 60
   Proposition 1: that CTPs can support new teachers as they enter teaching ...................... 61
Proposition 2: that CTPs can enhance pedagogy, which can lead to greater skills for teachers in the classroom and improved outcomes for students .......................................................... 62

Proposition 3: that the dynamics of school culture can (a) impact on the success and character of CTPs in each setting and (b) be enhanced by CTPs ........................................................................... 65

Proposition 4: that CTPs address significant issues for schooling that are worth the investment by policy makers and politicians .......... 67

Chapter Three: Methodology .................................................................................................................. 70

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................... 70

Mixed methods ....................................................................................................................................... 70

Research question .................................................................................................................................. 72

Methods of analysis ................................................................................................................................. 73

Case study research ................................................................................................................................. 74

Survey research ....................................................................................................................................... 82

Teachers’ voices and “solidarity research” ............................................................................................... 86

Chapter Four: Findings from a survey of new teachers in the same district as the CTP case studies ................................................................. 89

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................... 89

Findings from the questionnaire .............................................................................................................. 91

New teachers’ feelings about their work ................................................................................................. 91

Important areas for new teacher focus and their own ratings of success ........................................... 97

Groups who provide support for new teachers ............................................................................... 105

New teacher expectations about levels of support ............................................................................ 113

Useful forms of support to new teachers and reasons why ............................................................... 128

Ways to improve support for new teachers ......................................................................................... 138

Feelings of isolation/disenchantment, and who assisted ................................................................. 141

Overall directions for career and experiences that have influenced these directions ....................... 149

Summary .............................................................................................................................................. 153

Chapter Five: Findings from the case studies ...................................................................................... 160
Proposition 3: that the dynamics of school culture can (a) impact on the success and character of CTPs in each setting and (b) be enhanced by CTPs........................................................................... 258

School culture at Alkimos High School .......................................................... 259
Collegial relationships close to the classroom .................................................. 260
Ways that CTPs can enhance school culture ..................................................... 264
The impact of structured collaboration on school culture ............................ 268
The question of teacher socialisation .............................................................. 269
A case for redefining the role of supervisors ............................................... 272

Proposition 4: that CTPs address significant issues for schooling that are worth the investment by policy makers and politicians............... 275
Creating systemic support that extends beyond luck ................................. 276
The ideal structure for CTPs ........................................................................... 279
Role of teachers in reform, and other benefits for organisations ............... 287
Potential negative spirals facing new teachers ............................................ 288
Three cycles for success created by CTPs ................................................. 292

Summary ........................................................................................................ 302

Chapter Seven: Conclusions, recommendations and implications ..........303

Introduction ..................................................................................................... 303

Proposition 1: that CTPs offer potential benefits that can support new teachers as they enter teaching ................................................................. 304
Recommendations .......................................................................................... 307

Proposition 2: that CTPs offer potential benefits for enhancing pedagogy, which can lead to greater skills for teachers in the classroom and improved outcomes for students ....................................................... 308
Recommendations .......................................................................................... 310

Proposition 3: that the dynamics of school culture can (a) impact on the success and character of CTPs in each setting and (b) be enhanced by CTPs ........................................................................... 311
Recommendations .......................................................................................... 313

Proposition 4: that the capacity of CTPs to address significant issues for schooling offer potential benefits for policy makers and politicians .......... 314
Recommendations .......................................................................................... 315

Future research ............................................................................................. 316
List of tables and figures

Table 1: Mentoring activities reported by experienced teachers during their beginning teacher’s first year (Wildman et al., 1992, pp. 208–209) .. 40
Table 2: Results of Q1. Rate the extent to which you find your work to be .......................................................... 93
Table 3: Chloe’s Comments for the first four questions................................. 94
Table 4: Q2. Rate the extent to which you would identify the following as being important areas for new teachers to focus on as they commence teaching.......................................................... 98
Table 5: Q3. Rate the extent to which you would identify your teaching success in the areas of: .......................................................... 101
Table 6: Q4. Rate the extent to which the following groups provide support for your work. ........................................................................ 106
Table 7: Expectations about the level of support that will be provided...115
Table 8: Judgements about the level of support provided......................... 118
Table 9: Types of support........................................................................ 122
Table 10: Reasons why particular support was useful ......................... 129
Table 11: Overall direction for career and positive/negative experiences that have influenced future directions. ........................................... 149
Table 12: Percentages of students off task at five-minute intervals during lesson observation for same Year 7 Art class................................. 175
Table 13: Percentages of students off task at five-minute intervals during lesson observations of Year 10 Sports Science......................... 212

Figure 1: Items in order of percentages of respondents who chose “very significant” for Question 4: items related to support offered for the work of new teachers.......................................................... 110
Figure 2: Forms of support offered that were useful.............................. 132
Figure 3: Feelings of isolation/disenchantment...................................... 141
Figure 4: People who helped new teachers when they felt disenchaunted or isolated........................................................................ 147
Figure 5: A negative spiral that new teachers might face....................... 291
Figure 6: Three cycles for success through CTPs............................... 293
Figure 7: Cycle for success one: support for classroom management... 294
Figure 8: Cycle for success two: developing a broader repertoire of teaching skills.......................................................... 297
Figure 9: Cycle for success three: a “dynamic curriculum”............... 299
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short Form</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AITSL</td>
<td>Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CREST</td>
<td>Collaboration for Rural Education Special Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTP</td>
<td>Collaborative Teaching Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DET</td>
<td>NSW Government Department of Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DP</td>
<td>deputy principal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FN</td>
<td>field note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LBOTE</td>
<td>Language Backgrounds Other Than English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCEEDYA</td>
<td>Ministerial Council for Education, Early Childhood Development and Youth Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCEETYA</td>
<td>Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAT</td>
<td>Newly Appointed Teachers program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDHPE</td>
<td>Personal Development, Health and Physical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PE</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PISA</td>
<td>Programme for International Student Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PL</td>
<td>professional learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>socio-economic status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VA</td>
<td>visual arts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

New teachers enter the profession facing all the challenges of learning to teach (Feiman-Nemser, 2001) at a time when teaching is becoming more complex and is under significant reform (Istance, 2001; Brooks and Scott, 2000; Dinham, 2000; Hargreaves, 1997, 1994). In response, educational systems are looking at ways to better support new teachers which can increase their retention within the profession (eg. Johnson 2006; OECD, 2005; Smith and Ingersoll, 2004; Ramsey, 2000) and sustain positive views about their work (eg. Wang, Odell and Schwille, 2008; Goddard and Goddard, 2006; Feiman-Nemser, 2001). There is an increasing focus on professional development and teacher collaboration in general (eg. Thomas, 2005; MEXT, 2004; McLaghlin, 1997), with some researchers highlighting the particular benefits of mentoring for new teachers and supporting renewal of teaching practice across the profession (Le Cornu and Peters, 2005; Hargreaves and Fullan, 2000).

An extensive review of the literature regarding induction, mentoring and team teaching underpins my theoretical development of a concept I term ‘Collaborative Teaching Partnerships’ or CTPs as a way of supporting new professionals as they enter teaching. CTPs provide an opportunity for an experienced and new teacher to work on at least one shared class in a team teaching situation. Rather than the “sit, listen and reflect” (Long, 1997, p.115) approach of traditional mentoring processes, CTPs promote a process of joint planning, teaching and reflection.
In addition to the conceptual development of CTPs, I also test them in practice using case study research. The hypothesis is that mentoring which takes place in the setting of the classroom utilising team teaching can: first, deepen and extend the potential benefits of mentoring that have been articulated in the literature and; second, address the some of the concerns which have also been raised about the limitations of mentoring. While team teaching has generally been investigated within the literature as a way of supporting improved student outcomes, or in pre-service training for teachers, this project seeks to specifically investigate the advantages for teachers during their induction into the profession.

Through the review of literature, case study research, and by analysing questionnaire data collected from the same district as the case study school I identify a number of “negative spirals” or factors that were found to combine in a way that can compound the challenges for new teachers. Most importantly, findings from the research project demonstrate the potential to utilise effective support processes, including CTPs, to create “cycles for success”, a term I use to describe factors which can combine in a positive manner to create compounding benefits for new teachers.

In a practical sense my research seeks to benefit individuals who have or might be involved in a CTP process. Academically, my research can influence the theoretical development of models for supporting new teachers. At a policy level, my research demonstrates how support for new teachers could be enhanced in a form that can be delivered in practice.