

## Who wrote *Dido, Queen of Carthage*? An Authorship Glossary

1. The title page of the 1594 Quarto of *Dido, Queen of Carthage* includes the statement: ‘Written by Christopher Marlowe and Thomas Nash. Gent.’ Debate on Nashe’s contribution to the play has persisted for several centuries, with commentators attributing the play to Marlowe, or to Nashe, or to some combination of both. Was Nashe co-author, plotter, collaborator, editor, completer, adapter, reviser, publisher, literary executor, or borrower? Or not present at all?

This Glossary evaluates a set of verbal evidence proposed in support of Nashe’s co-authorship that has influenced editors and critics for the past fifty years. The useful term ‘Nasheism’ for this evidence was suggested by Martin Wiggins in 2008 and applies to a particular set of editorial suggestions in the 1968 Revels Plays edition: ‘the vocabulary and spelling evidence gathered by H. J. Oliver, who found Nasheisms scattered through the play, most prominently in the opening scene’ (Wiggins, 526). Oliver’s ‘evidence’ is then cited in support of *Dido*’s joint authorship in the authoritative catalogue, *British Drama*: ‘Oliver detects vocabulary evidence for Nashe’s presence in 1.1–2, 2.1, 3.1, 3.3, 4.3–4 (especially 1.1), and spelling evidence in 1.1, 4.4, 5.1’ (2.444).

This Glossary examines Oliver’s Nasheisms in detail, concluding that they do not provide sufficient evidence for Nashe as co-author. The analysis of each item extends beyond the identification of verbal parallels to consider the use and meaning in context, in *Dido* and in the texts of both Nashe and Marlowe. It also assesses the item’s relevance to any wider patterns of thought, emotion, and imagination in these texts. As Taylor and Loughnane suggest, studies of vocabulary should pay attention to the ‘whole complex pattern of an author’s vocabulary’ rather than just ‘individual words’ (435).

Oliver defines his selection as containing ‘more than a dozen words that are found elsewhere in Nashe but not in Marlowe, and at least three classical allusions to which Nashe’s other works offer closer parallels than do Marlowe’s’ (xxii–xxiii). In order of occurrence in *Dido*, the sixteen items on the list are ‘exhaled’, ‘Vulcan dancing’, ‘Dolon’, ‘Atlas ... underprops’, ‘eternish’, ‘attract’, ‘shelves’, ‘famoused (for)’, ‘ticing’, ‘Megaera’s eyes’, ‘bed-rid’, ‘Gaetulian’, ‘man of men’, ‘(take) soil’, ‘glassy fields’, ‘hoysing’. Oliver also offers ‘very tentative observations on spelling that may be authorial, including several that may suggest

Nashe's hand' (xxiv–xxv); the passages he notes as affected are: 1.1.1-160 ('aire', 'thine'); 4.4 ('hoysing', 'the emperiall', 'Punike', 'in my steede'); 5.1, Hermes scene ('the Empire', 'thine'). In addition to the sixteen Nasheisms, this Glossary also discusses 'aire', 'Punic', and 'thine/thy', as well as 'honey words' and 'mought' (mentioned in Oliver's commentary notes), and a parallel not noted by Oliver, 'striving tongues'. Oliver is nevertheless more cautious than some of the writers who have followed him. He proposes rather than insists, commenting that: 'There is always a statistical possibility that in any one work an author will use some words that he does not use elsewhere' (xxiii), and that Nashe may have been 'transcribing' rather than 'composing' (xxiii). He concludes that: 'These observations are at best, however, straws in the wind' (xxv).

The argument for co-authorship based on the Nasheisms relies upon a kind of frequency. It assumes that the mere accumulation of instances is weighty enough to establish co-authorship — the sufficiency of the sixteen — without taking into account the consistency of the selection criteria or the reliability of each item as evidence. Oliver's Nasheisms are an assorted collection. Some rely upon spelling, an unreliable indicator at a time when transcribers and compositors might intervene between manuscript and print. Some are listed in a form not actually found in Nashe, or where Marlowe texts have related forms. Some are commonplace, and some are found in *Dido* because they are part of telling the story. Most of the items are not particularly characteristic of 'Nashe' words. Indeed, of the sixteen, twelve occur three times or less amongst the many thousands of words in Nashe's writings, eight of them only once. There are Nashe favourites, like 'Atlas' and 'exhaled', but these are also commonly found in other authors. Oliver inherited eleven of the Nasheisms from earlier editors and critics, yet most of these items were originally intended to suggest literary parallels, without any implications for authorship. Boas had earlier listed seven of these, describing them as 'some rare words, or with unusual meanings, found in Nashe and not in Marlowe' (50).

2. **Word frequencies** for Marlowe are derived from the Concordance compiled by Fehrenbach and others; this is based on the old-spelling two-volume edition of Bowers (1973). Word frequencies for Nashe are derived from the two-volume Concordance compiled by Ule; this is based on McKerrow's old-spelling edition of Nashe, but with the spelling modernised; it was thus necessary to locate the words in their original form in McKerrow's text (in which endeavour, McKerrow's index proved useful but far from comprehensive).

Nashe citations are from McKerrow, in the form ‘volume.page.line’, except for *Summer*, which is ‘volume.page.TLN’. Other sources have been the *Oxford English Dictionary Online*; Crystal, *Shakespeare’s Words*; Abbott, *Shakespearian Grammar*. Marlowe texts are cited from the Revels Plays editions, including the new Revels Plays edition of *Dido, Queen of Carthage*, ed. Ruth Lunney (forthcoming). Nashe texts are cited from McKerrow’s edition; and Shakespeare texts from the Oxford *Complete Works*, second edition, edited by Wells and others. Classical authors (Homer, Virgil, Ovid) are cited from the Loeb texts.

3. **Marlowe:** The following abbreviations are used for individual works: *AOE*: *All Ovid’s Elegies*; *Dido*: *Dido, Queen of Carthage*; *DFa*: *Doctor Faustus*, A-text; *DFb*: *Doctor Faustus*, B-text; *E2*: *Edward II*; *HL*: *Hero and Leander*; *JM*: *The Jew of Malta*; *Lucan*: *Lucan’s First Book*; *MP*: *The Massacre at Paris*; *1Tam*: *Tamburlaine the Great, Part 1*; *2Tam*: *Tamburlaine the Great, Part 2*.

**Nashe’s works, with publication dates** (based on McKerrow).

<i>Anatomy</i> (1589)	<i>The Anatomy of Absurdity</i> ; SR 19 September 1588; editions: 1589, 1590.
<i>Menaphon</i> (1589)	‘Preface’ to Robert Greene’s <i>Menaphon</i> ; SR 25 August 1589.
<i>Almond</i> (1590)	<i>An Almond for a Parrat</i> ; anti-Martinist pamphlet.
<i>Astrophel</i> (1591)	‘Preface’ to Sidney’s <i>Astrophel and Stella</i> .
<i>Pierce</i> (1592)	<i>Pierce Penilesse, His Supplication to the Devil</i> ; SR 8 August 1592; editions: 1592 (3), 1593, 1595.
<i>Strange</i> (1592)	<i>Strange News of the Intercepting of Certain Letters</i> ; SR 12 January 1593; editions: 1592 (2), 1593 (3).
<i>Tears</i> (1593)	<i>Christ’s Tears over Jerusalem</i> ; SR 8 September 1593; editions: 1593, 1594, 1613.
<i>Traveller</i> (1594)	<i>The Unfortunate Traveller</i> ; written 1593–?1594: text of first edition concludes ‘wish me well, 27 June 1593’; editions: 1594 (2).
<i>Terrors</i> (1594)	<i>The Terrors of the Night</i> ; SR 30 June 1593; 25 October 1594; written early 1593, with additions 1594 (McKerrow, 4.197).
<i>Saffron–Walden</i> (1596)	<i>Have with You to Saffron-Walden</i> .
<i>Lenten</i> (1599)	<i>Nashe’s Lenten Stuff</i> ; SR 11 January 1599.
<i>Summer</i> (1600)	<i>Summer’s Last Will and Testament</i> ; SR 28 October 1600; written and performed 1592.
<i>Choice</i>	<i>The Choice of Valentines</i> ; circulated in MS.

## The Glossary

4. **aire (Q spelling):** ‘By Saturn’s soul and this earth-threatening hair’ (1.1.10); ‘Yet shall the aged sun shed forth his hair’ (1.1.159).

Not on the list of Nasheisms. Mentioned by Oliver (xxiv) as possibly indicating Nashe’s authorship, since *Dido* has ‘ayre’ for ‘air’ elsewhere. The Q readings are more likely errors in the printing, as Brooke suggests (1.1.159n.). Neither Marlowe nor Nashe uses the spelling ‘aire’ for ‘hair’. ‘Haire’ later occurs five times in *Dido*, and it is Nashe’s spelling in the parallel reference to Jupiter and earthquakes in *Traveller* (2.217.23-4).

5. **Atlas ... underprops:** ‘those starry towers / That earth-born Atlas groaning underprops’ (1.1.98-9).

On Oliver’s Nasheism list, but a classical commonplace. As Brooke notes, the association of Atlas with stars recalls *Aen* 4.481–2: ‘where mightiest Atlas on his shoulders turns the sphere, inset with gleaming stars’ (‘*ubi maximus Atlas / axem umero torquet stellis ardentibus aprum*’). References to Atlas are found in both Nashe and Marlowe texts. Oliver cites *Summer* (2.245.372): ‘But, Atlas-like, to prop heaven on one’s back’, although the closest parallel (without the stars) may be Envy described as wishing ‘like Atlas [to] underprop heaven alone’ (*Pierce*, 1.184.14–15); *Anatomy* (1.19.21–3) mentions Atlas and stars but not ‘underprop’. Atlas’s shoulders are mentioned several times in Marlowe texts, as in ‘Such breadth of shoulders as might mainly bear / Old Atlas’ burden’ (*ITam* 2.1.10-11); for other instances, see *2Tam* 4.1.129, and *E2* 3.1.77. ‘Underprops’ occurs in the description of Rome (*DFa* 3.1.32). As for the ‘starry towers’ Atlas is supporting, cf. ‘the world’s star-spangled towers’ (*AOE* 3.9.21), ‘the starry frame’ (*Dido*, 5.1.302), or ‘the starry firmament’ (*2Tam* 2.4.106). For Nashe, ‘Atlas’ (found nine times) and ‘underprop’ (seven) are multipurpose terms with various forms: e.g., George Peele as the ‘Atlas of Poetry’ (*Menaphon*, 3.323.27); the ‘Atlas-burden’ of London’s ‘insolences’ (*Tears*, 2.53.34); ‘as though the Church of England were upheld and Atlased by corruption’ (*Saffron-Walden*, 3.138.26-8); see also *Tears*, 2.53.34; *Tears*, 2.117.12; *Anatomy*, 1.44.2–3; *Summer*, 3.245.372. Various abstractions ‘underprop’ or are ‘underpropped’: Pride (*Pierce*, 1.175.11), Envy (*Pierce*, 1.184.15), reputation (*Strange*, 1.291.10), and confutation (*Pierce*, 1.191.29).

‘Underpropping’ is more literal in *Tears*, 2.117.1–2; and in the description of Zadock being tortured in *Traveller*: ‘his nails they half raised up and then underpropped them with sharp pricks, like a tailor’s shop window half open on a holy day’ (2.316.7-10).

6. **attract**: ‘*The while thine eyes attract their sought-for joys*’ (1.1.136).

On Oliver’s list of Nasheisms (xxiii), in the sense of ‘draw, take in’ (*OED* 1c, obs.); earlier listed by Boas (50) and by Grosart, for whom the word is the key to Nashe’s involvement in the play (see below). Oliver comments (1.1.136n.) that ‘Nashe, but not Marlowe, uses the word in this sense elsewhere’. However, Marlowe does use the related form ‘attractive’ in a sense close to Venus’s active eyes in *Dido*: in Theridamas’s ‘Such power attractive shines in princes’ eyes’, where the eyes are not merely admirable but have the active power to gain possessions (‘to ask, and have’), compel obedience (‘command, and be obeyed’), and even by their ‘looks’ to ‘breed love’ (*ITam* 2.5.62-4). Something of the same quality may be suggested in Helena’s envious description of Hermia’s ‘blessèd and attractive eyes’ (*MND* 2.2.97); or those of Thomas Watson’s mistress in his Sonnet, or ‘Passion’, 21: ‘which are two heavenly stars. / Their beams draw forth by great attractive power / My moistened heart’ (1.16–17; 1582). ‘Attract’ is found six times in Nashe texts, with ‘attractive’ twice.

McKerrow glosses ‘attract’ in Nashe’s works as meaning to ‘take in’, although in the related but different senses of ‘imagine’, ‘conceive’, or ‘understand’; the term is usually applied to ideas or information, rather than to physical perception as in *Dido* and *Tamburlaine*. In *Menaphon*, writers ‘attract’ infection from translating French works (3.316.22); in *Tears*, the terrors of hell are evoked: ‘It is a thousand thousand times worse than to be staked on the top of Etna or Mongiball. A hundred thousand thousand times more than thought can attract, or supposition apprehend’ (2.168.24-7); and in *Pierce*, Nashe asks: ‘canst thou not attract the true image of hypocrisy, under the description of the Fox and the Chameleon?’ (*Pierce*, 1.226.31-3). The closest in meaning to *Dido*’s ‘attract’ is *Summer*’s ‘I must give credit unto what I heare; / For other than I heare, attract I ought’ (3.260.866-7). ‘Attractive’ in Nashe is applied to things enticing but dangerous: ‘the attractive melting eye of that strumpet [Helen]’ (*Lenten*, 3.185.4-5); ‘his [Harvey’s] attractive eloquence’ (*Saffron–Walden*, 3.96.30).

Although Grosart claims that ‘attract’ is the key to establishing Nashe as the main author of *Dido*, he provides little supporting evidence, merely stating that: ‘one might have set down a passage in “Dido” as most certainly Marlowe’s, but in it occurs a so singularly used Nashe word as to certify it to be his. See Glossarial Index, under “Attract.” And so throughout’

(6.xxii). The Glossarial Index (6.176) just notes parallels with Nashe's *Summer*, the item reading: '*Attract*, 6.13, 24 ("Dido" [line] 139, "Summer" [line] 938) = to draw to or on. 'Had it not thus occurred twice, and independently, we might have suspected error for "attrect," from "attrecto," I handle'.

7. **bed-rid (Q bedred)**: '*Whereat he lifted up his bed-rid limbs*' (2.1.250).

A Nasheism, based on spelling, a notably uncertain guide to authorship. Oliver lists 'bedred' as a word 'at least as likely to be Nashe's as Marlowe's' (xxiii), noting (2.1.250n.) that the Q spelling 'bedred' is found several times in Nashe. On the other hand, 'bedred' appears to be the usual spelling before 1600, with all but one instance (c.1000) cited in *OED* spelt with -red: 'bedred' (1340), 'beedered' (c.1450), 'beddred' (1535, Act of Parliament), 'bedred' (1564), 'bedred' (1598, *LLL* 1.1.136). 'Bed-rid' is more common after 1600: Marlowe's *Lucan* (published 1600) has 'bed-rid' ('All rise in arms, nor could the bed-rid parents / Keep their sons', 1.502-3), as does the 1603 Q1 *Hamlet*: 'olde Norway ... impudent / And bed-rid' (B2v). As for Oliver's 'several times', 'bedred' is found only three times in Nashe: 'a poor bedred lazer [leper]' (*Terrors*, 1.376.19), with two later figurative uses, in *Saffron-Walden* (of Harvey's writings, borrowing Nashe's name 'to help his bed-rid stuff limp out of St Paul's churchyard,' 3.35.20-1), and in *Lenten* ('their bed-rid spittle positions', 3.185.24).

8. **Dolon**: '*See how the night, Ulysses-like, comes forth / And intercepts the day, as Dolon erst. / Ay me! The stars, surprised, like Rhesus' steeds / Are drawn by darkness forth Astraeus' tents*' (1.1.70-3).

Oliver includes this Nasheism as one of the classical allusions 'to which Nashe's other works offer closer parallels than do Marlowe's' (xxii-xxiii); it is also on Boas's list (50). Oliver's view is based on a comment by McKerrow, that 'the passages seem too much alike to be independent', although he is 'not fully convinced' (4.296). The Dolon story is a common classical allusion, and *Dido*'s version is consistent with the story as told in Homer, Virgil, and at least one Ovid version (see Ulysses, *Met* 238-54); the incident is also alluded to in Marlowe's *AOE*, 1.9.17-24. The Nashe parallel in *Traveller* (2.220.22-4) does not match these classical versions (or *Dido*'s), in either detail or sequencing of detail: 'You have read stories (I'll be sworn he never looked in book in his life) how many of the Roman worthies were there that hath gone as spies into their enemies' camp. Ulysses, Nestor, Diomedes, went

as spies together in the night into the tents of Rhesus, and intercepted Dolon, the spy of the Trojans' (*Traveller*, 2.220.22-4). In context, Jack Wilton is cynically setting up one of his 'jests' or 'famous achievements', persuading an 'ugly mechanical captain' to spy on the French camp (he was so stupid and incompetent they whipped him back to the English camp, literally). The traditional versions locate the intercepting of Dolon *before* the raid on the tents; Ulysses and Diomedes kill him and raid the camp of Rhesus, where Diomedes kills Rhesus and Ulysses seizes his horses. There are other anomalies. The 'worthies' named by Nashe were Greek rather than 'Roman'; and 'the inclusion of Nestor', McKerrow concedes (4.261), 'suggests some other source'. Nashe's version reads more like an imperfect memory of Ovid, perhaps derived from the brief version in *Heroides*, 1.37–40 (Penelope to Ulysses), supposedly told to Penelope's son by Nestor. This apparently reverses the sequence of events by mentioning the killing of Rhesus before that of Dolon – quite possibly for the rhetorical effect of the word-play on 'Dolon': 'He told as well of Rhesus' and Dolon's fall by the sword, how the one was betrayed by slumber, the other undone by guile' ('*rettulit et ferro Rhesumque Dolonaque caesos, / utque sit hic somno proditus, ille dolo*').

9. **eternish**: '*Who [Romulus and Remus] will eternize [Q eternish] Troy in their attempts*' (1.1.108).

Oliver lists this spelling as a Nasheism, a form 'as likely to be Nashe's as Marlowe's' (xxiii), but the evidence is insufficient. McKerrow (4.296) claims that 'eternish' is 'common', but *OED* notes the term as obsolete and cites only four instances, all 1578–1594; the impression is of a term briefly fashionable and possibly considered 'poetic'. The earliest instance is from Lyly's 1578 *Euphues* (f.49; Revels edition, 102), which may have suggested the use in *Dido*. Oliver claims (1.1.108n.) that Nashe uses 'eternish' elsewhere, but it is found only once, as 'eternisht', in the *Menaphon* Preface (3.314.17) in 1589, which may be a borrowing from Greene's 'eternisht' in the *Menaphon* narrative. Elsewhere in Nashe, *Pierce* has 'eternizde' (1.159.23), and the other four instances have '-ize'. The early editions of Marlowe texts use the '-ize' form (four times), and 'eternisde' once (*2Tam* 5.1.35).

10. **exhaled**: '*Whose face reflects such pleasure to mine eyes / As I, exhaled with thy fire-darting beams, / Have oft driven back the horses of the night*' (1.1.24-6); *The sun 'shall here unburden their exhalèd sweets*' (5.1.14).

Oliver lists as a Nasheism, ‘found elsewhere in Nashe but not in Marlowe’ (xxii), but this does not take other forms into account: the related term ‘exhalation/s’ occurs in both Nashe (three times) and Marlowe texts (four times). The term is not uncommon: McKerrow notes related uses of ‘exhale’ in Greene; *OED* adds Chapman; and Crystal cites instances from Shakespeare, including Anne’s accusation (*R3* 1.2.58) that Richard’s presence ‘exhales’ the blood from Henry VI’s corpse. ‘Exhale/d/ingly’, mostly in the sense of ‘draw/n up’, is found thirteen times in Nashe texts, with many instances referring to harmful substances being drawn up either by the sun or some spiritual or political power: noxious smells from dunghills by the autumn sun (*Summer*, 3.248.482); superstitions by preachers (*Lenten*, 3.197.28); or the ‘excrements’ of society, those fit only for warfare, by the state, with a fall-back option of ‘some light toys’ like plays to prevent ‘mutinies’ (*Pierce*, 1.211.28–33). The image of exhaling is even adopted for literary criticism: Sidney is praised (‘now that cloud of sorrow is dissolved which fiery Love exhaled from his dewy hair’, *Astrophel*, 3.330.22–3), but Thomas Kyd becomes a victim: ‘The sea exhaled by drops will in continuance be dry, and Seneca, let blood line by line and page by page, at length must needs die to our stage’ (*Menaphon*, 3.316.1–4). The second instance of ‘exhaled’ in *Dido* refers to a similar process: the ‘rich odours’ from Egypt are ‘exhaled’ by the sun and then downloaded by its ‘burning beams’ (5.1.11–14). In Marlowe, ‘exhalations’ are associated with powerful natural forces, comparable with Jupiter’s powers in *Dido*: in *Tamburlaine*, they are ‘windy’, ‘freezing’, ‘fiery’, or ‘fiery meteors’ in ‘heaps of exhalations’, *2Tam* 3.2.3–4); these meanings derive from sixteenth-century notions of astronomy and meteorology in which substances or qualities (hot and dry ‘exhalations’, warm and moist ‘vapours’) were drawn up or ‘exhaled’, especially by the sun, to become ‘meteors’ (the term could refer to any natural phenomenon observed beneath the moon, including wind, clouds, rain, lightning, meteors, even comets (see Heninger); . Nashe’s ‘exhalations’ are rather different: they apply to the ‘stinking exhalations’ of the plague in Rome, trapped beneath the clouds (*Traveller*, 2.286.13); to social climbers, ‘whelps of the first litter of gentility, these exhalations, drawn up to the heaven of honour from the dunghill of abject fortune’ (*Pierce*, 1.174.23–5); and to the blood of the righteous staining the sky ‘with cloddered exhalations’ (*Tears*, 2.21.7).

11. **famoused (for)**: ‘An ancient empire, famousèd for arms’ (1.2.21); ‘There is a woman, famousèd for arts’ (5.1.275).



Oliver lists the expression as found elsewhere in Nashe but not in Marlowe (as does Boas, 50), yet the evidence is less than convincing. The actual construction ('famoused for ...') is uncommon: *OED* records it as obsolete, citing a few seventeenth-century examples, and a few related expressions in the 1590s. The construction is found in one of the two Nashe instances of 'famoused': 'noble *Salustius* [du Bartas] hath famoused [Sidney and others] ... for the chief pillars of our English speech' (*Pierce*, 1.194.1-3); in the other instance, the construction is different: Nashe addresses Gabriel Harvey, who 'dost no good works, but thinks to be famoused by a strong faith of thy own worthiness' (*Strange*, 1.287.26-8). The usage may depend upon metre: compare Shakespeare's Sonnet 25 (line 9): 'The painful warrior famousèd for might', and Marlowe's 'Famous for nothing but for theft and spoil' (*ITam* 4.3.66). Two other instances before 1600 not cited in *OED* are '[King Arthur] famoused as much for the renown of his round table, as Alcides for his twelve labours, Jason for his journey to Calchos, or the Greeks for their triumphs at Troy' (Christopher Middleton, *The Famous Historie of Chinon of England* (1597), STC 17866, Early English Prose Fiction Full-Text Database (Cambridge: Chadwyck-Healey, 1997), page [(50)], accessed 28/10/2015); and 'Ye modern Laureates famoused for your writ', the first line of the dedicatory poem of an anonymous 41-poem lyric sequence, *Zepheria*, published 1594, also printed by Joan Orwin (ProQuest Literature Online; accessed 28/10/2015).

12. **Gaetulian:** '*How now, Gaetulian, are ye grown so brave*' (3.3.19).

Oliver lists 'Gaetulian' as a Nasheism (as does Boas, 50), while also noting its disparaging use in both Virgil and Ovid. In Virgil, Anna cites 'Gaetulian cities' as amongst Carthage's hostile neighbours (*Aen* 4.40) and Dido fears 'Gaetulian Iarbas' taking her captive (*Aen* 4.326). In *Heroides*, 7.125, Dido expresses her contempt for Aeneas by the challenge: 'Why do you not bind me forthwith, and give me over to Gaetulian Iarbas?' ('*quid dubitas vinctam Gaetulo tradere Iarbae?*'). In *Dido*, the term is simply part of the narrative. Nashe uses 'Getulian' once only, and as a general term of contempt: in *Saffron-Walden*, published two years after *Dido*, he refers to Harvey's writings as 'I wot not what other Getulian slabberies [McKerrow suggests 'drivel']' (3.114.4). The allusion occurs less than ten lines after he labels Harvey 'this goodwife Megara' (see entry for 'Megaera's eyes' below). Brooke comments (3.1.19n.) that *Dido* 'uses it [Gaetulian] contemptuously, which may have suggested it to Nashe, rather than some other epithet implying barbarousness'. Oliver

comments that ‘any word suggesting “African” may have a doubly depreciatory sense on the Elizabethan stage if Iarbas were portrayed as black’. The most popular translation of the *Aeneid* at the time, by Phaer, distinguishes the Carthaginians from other African peoples by labelling them the ‘white Moors of Africa’ (A3r).

13. **glassy fields:** ‘*Till he [Aeneas] hath furrowed Neptune’s glassy fields*’ (4.3.11).

Oliver includes the phrase as a Nasheism on the basis of Crawford’s marginal note (see Wilson’s Supplement to McKerrow, 5.43), which draws a parallel without implications for authorship. Oliver then (4.3.11n.) cites a similar phrase in Marlowe also referring to the sea: ‘Thetis’ glassy bower’ (*HL* 2.203). The supposed parallel with Nashe (and Nashe’s only use of ‘glassy’) occurs in *Lenten*, published five years after *Dido*: the context is one of humorous exaggeration, with Nashe describing the boats of the Yarmouth fishermen, ‘like great beef trays or kneading troughs’ (3.183.11–12), skimming over the water, or ‘through the glassy fields of Thetis’ (3.183.12–13).

14. **honey words:** ‘Ulysses ... Assayed with honey words to turn them back’ (2.1.136-7).

Unlike similar Crawford marginalia (‘Megaera’s eyes’ and ‘glassy fields’), Oliver does not list the term as a Nasheism. Crawford noted a parallel with *Traveller*, 2.288.10 (‘he assayed her with honey speech’), suggesting it was a borrowing from *Dido* (see McKerrow, 4.285). Nashe does use the same verb (‘assayed’) but the context is quite different, with ‘honey words’ just one method attempted by a Spanish home invader to seduce a lady left behind in a house of plague, along with ‘rough means’, killing her maid, and promises of jewels and gifts. Nashe does not use ‘assay/ed’ elsewhere; Marlowe uses ‘assay/s/ed’ in several texts.

15. **hoysing/hoisting:** ‘*And hoist [Q hoyst] aloft on Neptune’s hideous hills*’ (3.3.47); ‘*The sails were [Q hoysing] hoisting up, and he aboard*’ (4.4.15); ‘*As oft as he attempts to hoist (Q hoyst) up sail*’ (4.4.103); ‘*Was it not you [tackling] that hoisted [Q hoysed] up these sails*’ (4.4.153); ‘*And, spying me, hoist [Q hoyst] up the sails amain*’ (5.1.227).

Oliver identifies ‘hoysing’ (4.4.15) and ‘hoysed’ (4.4.153) as Nasheisms on spelling grounds, commenting of ‘hoysed’ that this is ‘the form which Nashe is known to have favoured’ (xxv).

He adds to this when he emends Q ‘hoysing’ to ‘hoising’, claiming (4.4.15n.) that this is ‘the earlier form of the word of which “hoist” is a corruption ... “Hoise” is not found elsewhere in Marlowe but is found in Nashe’. Oliver does not comment on the other three instances (all ‘hoyst’), modernising their spelling to ‘hoist’. ‘Hoising’ also appears on Boas’s list (50). The Nasheism cannot be sustained, and not only because spelling is an unreliable indicator of authorship. Oliver’s claim is not supported by Nashe’s practice, as recorded in McKerrow. The five instances include the spellings ‘oi’ as well as ‘oy’, and ‘–sted’ as well as ‘–sed’: ‘hoised’ (*Pierce*, 1.173.28); ‘hoyse’ (*Tears*, 2.41.26; 2.151.23); and ‘hoysted’ (*Lenten*, 3.200.10). The term is also found five times elsewhere in Marlowe, with ‘hoist’ in 2 *Tamburlaine* and the *Elegies*, and ‘hoisted’ twice in 1 *Tamburlaine*. *OED* records Q ‘oy’ spelling as common in the sixteenth century, but ‘oi’ and ‘y’ are also found. The term originated from a sailor’s cry when raising sails, as ‘hyse’ or ‘hoyse’; the ‘hoyst’ and ‘hoist’ spellings (corruptions from ‘hoysed’) are recorded in *OED* from 1509 (‘hoyst’) and 1548 (‘hoist’).

16. **man of men:** *‘But should that man of men – Dido except – / Have taunted me in these opprobrious terms’* (3.3.26).

Listed as a Nasheism (Oliver, xxv), but the expression is proverbial, with *OED* citing instances 1470-1887, including Cleopatra’s term for Antony, ‘My man of men’ (*A&C* 1.5.71). The single Nashe parallel is found in *Menaphon*, 3.317.26, applied to the renowned Greek scholar at Cambridge, Sir John Cheke.

17. **Megaera’s eyes:** (of Pyrrhus) *‘And with Megaera’s eyes, stared in their face, / Threatening a thousand deaths at every glance’* (2.1.230).

Oliver cites ‘Megaera’s eyes’ as a Nasheism: one of the ‘classical allusions to which Nashe’s other works offer closer parallels than do Marlowe’s’ (xxii-xxiii); in this, he again follows Crawford’s marginal notes (see Wilson/McKerrow, Supplement, 5.42). Oliver’s claim is misleading: the actual phrase is found only once, and in a very different context, associated with Nashe’s parody of *Hero and Leander* in the guise of fish. In *Lenten*, published five years after *Dido*, Nashe tells a fable of a Herring, proud despite his despicable appearance, who attempts to seduce an upper-class female fish (Lady Turbot) into letting him enter ‘her buskie

grove'; her response is (understandably) hostile: 'She stared at him with Megara's [sic] eyes, like Iris the messenger of Juno, and bad him go eat a fool's head and garlic, for she would none of him' (3.217.6-9). Megaera herself is a well-known classical figure. In *Saffron-Walden* (3.113.30), published two years after *Dido*, Nashe ridicules Harvey's style as belonging to 'this goodwife Megara [sic]' (and implies that he/she is a prostitute: 'up with your petticoat, have at your plum-tree', 3.113.28-9). Megaera herself appears in Marlowe's translation of *Lucan* (1.574-6), where she terrifies Hercules into madness.

18. **mought**: '*And might [Q mought] I live to see him sack rich Thebes*' (3.3.42).

Not listed as a Nasheism, but 'mought' is retained by Oliver 'lest it be thought relevant to questions of divided authorship' (3.3.42n.), although he also notes it may be 'only a compositor's aberration'. The term is not found elsewhere in Marlowe texts, and in Nashe it occurs only twice: 'he mought have sought his fortune in the seas' (*Almond*, 3.344.20-1); 'by uttering the best that, with a safe conscience, mought be uttered of the best or worst of them all' (*Lenten*, 3.167.18-19). Both 'might' and 'mought' are recorded in *OED* as sixteenth-century forms of the past tense of both 'may' and 'mote' (arch. = 'can, could'). *OED* cites the *Dido* instance for *may*<sup>1</sup> (20a, arch.), as occurring in a rejected or improbable hypothesis: as 'might' with infinitive, 'used in relation to the present or future'. Brooke (*Dido*) and Crystal cite the instance 'That mought not be distinguished' (3*H6* 5.2.45) for the sense 'might' = 'could'. A deliberate archaism is not impossible, recalling Spenser perhaps, with the effect of rendering Aeneas's wish even more remote than Iarbas's 'might': 'mought' is used several times in *Shepherds' Calendar* (1579) in the senses of 'might', 'could', and 'must'; e.g., (speaking of an injured sheep): 'Mought her neck be ioynted [disjointed] attones [at once] / She should have need[ed] no more spell [verse used as a charm] ... She mought ne [not] gang [go] on the green' ('March', 53-4, 57).

19. **Punic**: '*It is the Punic (Q punick) kingdom rich and strong (1.1.210); 'Sway thou the Punic (Q Punike) sceptre in my stead' (4.4.35); 'let him ride / As Dido's husband through the Punic (Q punicke) streets' (4.4.66-7).*

Not listed by Oliver as a Nasheism, but included with 'hoysing' in his 'very tentative observations on spellings that may be authorial, including several that may suggest Nashe's

hand' (xxiv-xxv). All three Q spellings are recorded by *OED* in sixteenth-century texts; other spellings recorded are 'Puniqué' and 'Punik'. Nashe also has 'Punical' (*Saffron-Walden*, 3.43.9). The term is, of course, appropriate to the narrative.

20. **shelves**: '*The Cyclops' shelves and grim Ceraunia's seat*' (1.1.147); '*Yea, all my navy split with rocks and shelves*' (3.1.107); '*Blow winds, threaten ye rocks and sandy shelves*' (4.4.58).

A Nasheism (Oliver, xxiii); also listed by Boas for the meaning 'sandbanks' (50). Oliver notes the term as 'found elsewhere in Nashe but not in Marlowe' (3.1.107n.), a view which ignores the appropriateness of 'shelves' as a narrative detail in a story about seafaring and shipwreck. Cf. *Lucrece* (335–6): 'Huge rocks, high winds, strong pirates, shelves, and sands / The merchant fears, ere rich at home he lands'. The *Dido* instances refer to submerged ledges of rock in the first example and sandbanks in the later ones. The difference in Q spelling ('shelves' in act 1 and 'shelves' later) may not be significant, with both spellings recorded by *OED* in the period. Moreover, Nashe rarely uses the term: apart from two mentions of a 'shelf' in a closet, 'shelves' occurs only three times in Nashe texts: first, in *Terrors*, where he imagines devils with 'faces far blacker than any ball of tobacco, great glaring eyes that had whole shelves of Kentish oysters in them' (1.379.19-21). The other two are found after the publication of *Dido*. In *Lenten*, the only comparable instance), Nashe describes 'Cerdicus ... who was the first mayor or captain of the morris dance that on those embenched [piled or banked up] shelves stamped his footing, where cods and dogfish swam' (3.161.16). In *Saffron-Walden*, the use is figurative, referring to London: 'I hold no place better governed, however in so great a sea of all waters there cannot choose but be some of quicksands and rocks and shelves' (3.130.12-14); cf. Margaret's warning against the York brothers in *3H6* (5.4.22-36), where Clarence is labelled 'a quicksand of deceit', and Richard of Gloucester, 'a rugged fatal rock' (the 1595 quarto does not include this passage).

21. **soil (take soil)**: '*Some to the mountains, some unto the soil*' (3.3.61).

Listed as a Nasheism (Oliver, xxiii), although in *Dido* the term is used literally, as part of the narrative, as a commonplace term derived from hunting. In Nashe, the expression is part of anecdotes with a message. In *Tears*, '[taking] soil' illustrates an exhortation to London to be

ashamed of her sinfulness: ‘Doth the buck (having befilth himself with the female) lift up his horns and walk proudly to the lawns? O no, he so hateth himself (by reason of the stench of his commixture) that all drooping and languishing, into some solitary ditch he withdraws himself, and takes soil, and batheth till such time as there fall a great shower of rain, when being thoroughly washed and cleansed, he posteth back to his food’ (2.112.13-20). In *Traveller*, the analogy is part of a woman’s plea to an intending rapist: ‘Deers oppressed with dogs, when they cannot take soil, run to men for succour: to whom should women in their disconsolate and desperate estate run to men (like the deer) for succour and sanctuary?’ (2.290.6-10). Nashe does use ‘soil’ nearly twenty more times, but in other senses, such as earth or ‘native’ soil. Cf. *AOE* 2.16.2: ‘A small, but wholesome soil, with watery veins’ (describing an escape to the country).

22. **striving tongues:** ‘*And let me link thy body to my lips, / That tied together by the striving tongues / We may as one sail into Italy*’ (4.3.28-30).

Not listed as a Nasheism, but the distinctive association of ‘tongues’ and ‘striving’ also occurs in Nashe’s *Traveller*: ‘Let our tongues meet and strive as they would sting’ (*Traveller*, 2.263.4). The line is part of a pseudo-Petrarchan sonnet supposedly written by the Earl of Surrey to his co-prisoner, Diamante:

If I must die, oh, let me choose my death.  
Suck out my soul with kisses, O cruel maid,  
In thy breasts’ crystal balls embalm my breath,  
Dole it all out in sighs when I am laid.  
Thy lips on mine like cupping glasses clasp,  
Let our tongues meet and strive as they would sting.  
Crush out my wind with one straight girding grasp,  
Stabs on my heart keep time whilst thou dost sing.  
Thy eyes like searing irons burn out mine,  
In thy fair tresses stifle me outright,  
Like Circes change me to a loathsome swine,  
So I may live forever in thy sight.  
Into heaven’s joys none can profoundly see,  
Except that first they meditate on thee. (*Traveller*, 2.262.34–263.12)

Forms of 'strife' and 'striving' occur numerous times in both Marlowe and Nashe, but not elsewhere in conjunction with 'tongues'. There are four mentions of tongue-kissing in Marlowe's translation of Ovid's *Amores*, but none are described as so vigorous: 'purloin', 'lay, 'hid', 'dips' (2.5.24, 57-8), 'eagerly' (3.6.9), and (least active) 'There in your rosy lips my tongue entomb' (3.13.23). Even Nashe's *Choice* does not compare: 'Thus gazing, and thus striving we persevere' (line 177), but the activities described do not include tongues. Earlier there has been kissing: 'she sprang full lightly to my lips, / and fast about the neck me colls and clips' (93-4), before she lies back and 'waggles with her tongue' (97). The sonnet is resonant of Marlowe, with the first lines echoing Faustus and Helen: 'Sweet Helen, make me immortal with a kiss. / Her lips sucks forth my soul' (*DFa*, 5.1.93-4). The burning eyes recall various images in Marlowe, from the mistress's eyes 'whose radiance burns out mine' (*AOE*, 3.10.48), to Zenocrate's eyes that 'shot fire from their ivory bowers' (*2Tam* 2.4.9), to Tamburlaine's 'fiery eyes' (*1Tam* 1.2.157), capable of sending lightning (*2Tam* 1.3.76), to the exchange of glances between Jupiter and Ganymede. There may also be other echoes of *Dido*, but stripped of their romance: 'But in his looks I see eternity, / And he'll make me immortal with a kiss' (4.4.122-3); 'Her silver arms will coll me round about' (4.3.51); 'Heaven, envious of our joys' (4.4.52).

23. **thine/thy**: Not in Oliver's list of Nasheisms, but mentioned in his 'tentative observations' on spelling (xxiv), where he notes the form 'thine' in 'thine eyes' (1.1.136) as an anomaly which may indicate Nashe's presence; this speculation is based on his analysis of the *Massacre* fragment, where the form used is 'thie' (before 'end', 'folishe dreame', and 'self'). Marlowe texts do use the 'presumably Marlovian' (Oliver, xxv) 'thy' more often, but 'thine' also occurs, particularly with words such as 'eyes' and 'ears'. In this, 'thy' and 'thine' adhere to the usual practice for marking emphasis, as described in Abbott 237: the forms 'mine' and 'thine' are 'almost always found' before words beginning with a vowel 'where no emphasis is intended'; hence 'thy eyes' or (for that matter) 'my eyes' would be more forceful. 'Thine eye/s' occurs in *Dido* at 1.1.19, 3.3.17, and 5.1.114; 'thy eye/s' at 3.2.34 and 3.4.16. The spelling 'thie' is not found in Marlowe's published works.

24. **ticing:** 'Whose [Sinon's] ticing tongue was made of Hermes' pipe' (2.1.145); 'ticing strumpet' (Helen, 2.1.300); 'ticing dame' (Dido, 4.3.31); Aeneas's 'ticing relics' (5.1. 277); 'tice a dolphin' (5.1.249).

Oliver identifies 'ticing' as a Nasheism, not found 'elsewhere in Marlowe', but the claim is misleading: neither Nashe nor Marlowe uses the actual form 'ticing' (both have 'tice', although the contexts are dissimilar; Nashe also has 'ticeth'). 'Tice', the aphetic form of 'entice', is not especially common; it is classed by *OED* as now obsolete except for dialect. *Dido*'s sense of 'alluring' is anticipated in Thomas Watson's Sonnet (or 'Passion') 72: 'my Love, / Whose ticing face is of more lively hue, / Than any saints in earth, or heaven above' (1.211). The use of 'tice' in *I Tamburlaine* is similar in meaning to the instances in *Dido*. Theridamas asks: 'What strong enchantments tice my yielding soul' (1.2.223; Oliver even cites this instance); and the epilogue to *Doctor Faustus* warns about 'unlawful things, / Whose deepness doth entice [original spelling is 'intice'] such forward wits' (lines 6-7). Nashe employs the forms 'tice' and 'ticeth' more narrowly, in the context of criminal activities; all three instances date from 1593–1594, possibly after familiarity with *Dido*. In *Traveller* (2.311.7-10), the supervillain Zadock declares: 'I'll tice all the young children into my house that I can get, and cutting their throats barrel them up in powdering beef tubs, and so send them to victual the Pope's galleys'. In *Tears* (2.97.16-20), Nashe rails against brokers and usurers: 'If one tice a prentice to rob his master, it is felony by the law; nay, it is a great penalty, if he do but relieve him and encourage him, being fled from his master's obedience and service. And shall we have no law for him that ticeth a son to rob his father?' Cf. *Titus Andronicus* (Tamora inciting murder and rape): 'These two have 'ticed me hither to this place' (2.2.92).

25. **Vulcan dancing:** 'Vulcan shall dance to make thee laughing sport' (1.1.32).

The most intriguing Nasheism, noted by Oliver as a classical allusion 'to which Nashe's other works offer closer parallels than do Marlowe's'; it is also listed by Boas (50). Elsewhere, Marlowe refers to Vulcan as smith and fabricator (*AOE* 1.2.24; *AOE* 2.17.19), or he mentions his lameness (*AOE* 2.17.20; *HL* 1.152); and, in his only other instance, Nashe criticises writers of 'amorous discourses, kindling Venus' flame in Vulcan's forge' (*Anatomy*, 1.10.28-9). The Vulcan dancing parallel with Nashe's *Summer* was first noted by Hazlitt and then Bullen, the latter commenting even so that 'the speech [in *Dido*] is undoubtedly by Marlowe'.



The different treatments of the allusion may indicate a shared idea but not necessarily shared authorship: *Dido* makes an absurd suggestion in passing, but *Summer* elaborates upon the notion – for eight lines of prose – to create a euphuistic plea for audience indulgence. Nashe compliments his elite audience (the play was probably presented before the Archbishop of Canterbury) and compares the ungainliness and good intentions of Vulcan, possibly as described in *Iliad*, 1.597-600, with similar traits in the boy actors:

To make the gods merry, the celestial clown Vulcan tuned his polt foot to the measures of Apollo's lute, and danced a limping galliard in Jove's starry hall. To make you merry, that are the gods of art and guides unto heaven, a number of rude Vulcans, unwieldy speakers, hammer-headed clowns (for so it pleaseth them in modesty to name themselves) have set their deformities to view, as it were in a dance here before you. Bear with their wants, lull melancholy asleep with their absurdities, and expect hereafter better fruits of their industry. (*Summer*, 3.294. 1930-8)

What makes the parallel even more intriguing is the stage business implicit some lines earlier, when Will Summers invites the 'pretty boy' who has come to deliver the Epilogue to sit on his knee, as Jupiter had dandled Ganymede in *Dido*: 'Come sit on my knee, and I'll dance thee, if thou canst not endure to stand' (*Summer*, 1898-1900). That the echoes are visual as well as verbal may indicate memories of performance. *Summer* was probably written and performed in 1592, although not published till 1600. The source of this allusion to Vulcan is obscure. Bullen suggests a common source for both *Dido* and *Summer* in the *Iliad* (1.597–600), where Vulcan's clumsy movements entertained the gods: as he moved about serving wine, 'unquenchable laughter arose among the blessed gods, as they saw Hephaestus puffing through the palace' (*Iliad*, 599–600); he thus restored harmony after a quarrel between Zeus and Hera. The *Iliad* does not mention Vulcan actually dancing, nor does another source suggested as 'nearer' by McKerrow, Erasmus's *Moriae Encomium* or *Praise of Folly* (1509). McKerrow (4.296) quotes from an 1816 edition: 'Vulcan too has always acted the "buffoon" at the banquets of the gods, and delighted the company by his limping or his taunts or the funny things he says' ('*Quin est Vulcanus ipse in deorum convivii ... agere consuevit, ac modo claudicatione, modo cavillis, modo ridiculis dictis exhilarare comotationem*'). What immediately follows this description, however – and may have influenced the *Dido* allusion – is the mention of three different figures or groups dancing to entertain the gods, including the disreputable Silenus, noted as 'obscenely dancing'. Another possibility is an incident described in Rabelais, in the 'Author's Prologue' to the Fourth Book of *Pantagruel*, where,

following the story of the woodcutter's axe, Vulcan celebrates his love: '*Vulcan, avec sa jambe torte, en feist pour l'amour de s'amie trois ou quatre beaulx petitz saux en plate forme*' (*Le quart livre des faits et dictz heroïques du bon Pantagruel*, 1<sup>st</sup> edition, Paris: 1552; Egham, Surrey: Runnymede Books, 1990). There was no sixteenth-century English translation, with later translations of 'saux' being 'hopping' or 'jumping' rather than 'dancing'.

## Works Cited

- Abbott E.A. Abbott, *A Shakespearian Grammar*, rev. edn (New York: Haskell House, 1972).
- Boas Frederick S. Boas, *Christopher Marlowe: A Biographical and Critical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1940).
- Bowers *Complete Works of Christopher Marlowe: Volume 1*, ed. Fredson Bowers (Cambridge University Press, 1973).
- Brooke *The Life of Marlowe and The Tragedy of Dido Queen of Carthage*, ed. C.F. Tucker Brooke (Methuen, 1930; New York: Gordian Press, 1966).
- Bullen *The Works of Christopher Marlowe: Volume 2*, ed. A. H. Bullen (London: Nimmo, 1885).
- Crystal David Crystal and Ben Crystal, *Shakespeare's Words: A Glossary and Language Companion* (London: Penguin, 2004).
- Fehrenbach et al. *A Concordance to the Plays, Poems, and Translations of Christopher Marlowe*, ed. Robert J. Fehrenbach, Lea Ann Boone, and Mario A. Di Cesare (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1982).
- Grosart *The Complete Works of Thomas Nashe*, ed. Alexander B. Grosart. 6 vols (London: 1885).
- Heninger S.K. Heninger, *A Handbook of Renaissance Meteorology: With Particular Reference to Elizabethan and Jacobean Literature* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1960).
- Nashe *The Works of Thomas Nashe*, ed. Ronald B. McKerrow, 5 vols (1904-10), rev. F.P. Wilson (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1966).
- OED *Oxford English Dictionary Online*.
- Oliver *Dido Queen of Carthage and The Massacre at Paris*, ed. H. J. Oliver, Revels (Manchester UP, 1968).
- Phaer Thomas Phaer, *The seven first books of the Eneidos of Virgil, converted in English measure by Thomas Phaer Esquire, solicitor to the King and Queen's Majesties, attending their honorable council in the marches of Wales, 1558*. BL C.56.e.2
- Q, Quarto *The Tragedy of Dido Queen of Carthage: Written by Christopher Marlowe and Thomas Nashe, 1594*, ed. John S. Farmer (Tudor Facsimile Texts, 1914).
- Shakespeare *The Oxford Shakespeare: The Complete Works*, 2nd edn, ed. Stanley Wells, Gary Taylor, John Jowett, and William Montgomery Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2005).
- Spenser *The Poetical Works of Edmund Spenser*, ed. J.C. Smith and E. de Selincourt (Oxford University Press, 1912).

- Taylor and Loughnane Gary Taylor and Rory Loughnane, 'The Canon and Chronology of Shakespeare's Works', *The New Oxford Shakespeare Authorship Companion*, ed. Gary Taylor and Gabriel Egan (Oxford University Press, 2017), 417–602.
- Ule Louis Ule, *A Concordance to the Works of Thomas Nashe*, 2 vols (Zurich: Olms-Weidemann, 1997).
- Watson *The Complete Works of Thomas Watson (1556–1592)*, ed. Dana F. Sutton, 2 vols (New York: Edwin Mellen Press, 1996).
- Wiggins Martin Wiggins, 'When did Marlowe Write *Dido, Queen of Carthage*?', *Review of English Studies* ns 59, No. 241 (2008), 521–41.
- Wiggins & Richardson Martin Wiggins and Catherine Richardson, *British Drama 1533-1642: A Catalogue: 1567-1589*, 10 vols (Oxford University Press, 2012–).