

Understanding Adoption, Implementation and Outcomes of New Public Management Reforms in Developing Countries: A Case Study of Botswana

Kaelo Molefhe

BA (Public Administration and Political Science)

University of Botswana

Master of Human Resource Management

Monash University (Australia)

Newcastle Business School

Faculty of Business and Law

University of Newcastle (Australia)

Thesis submitted for:

Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

2011

Statement of Originality

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Signed

Kaelo Molefhe

August 2011

Abstract

New Public Management (NPM) reforms came to prominence in the 1980s in developed countries introducing market principles in the running of the public sector organisations. In the specific case of developing countries, the drive towards such reforms emerged towards the late 1980s/early 1990s, often under coercion from external actors, as prescription to many of the problems afflicting their bureaucracies and the economy in general. This thesis investigates application of such reforms in developing countries. It does so by looking at the adoption, implementation and outcomes of NPM-type of reforms within one developing country; namely, Botswana. The specific reform measures considered in this study are Work Improvement Teams (WITs) and Performance Management System (PMS).

Since the early 1990s into the 2000s, the Botswana government grappled with issues of low productivity and performance within its public services that threatened specifically the capacity for effective public sector management and broadly the post-independence impressive socio-economic gains of the country and, thus, proved a strong imperative towards public sector reforms. Consequently, various reform efforts, including NPM ones, were applied across the public service to improve its efficiency and effectiveness. Among the NPM ones WITs and PMS were introduced.

Two government departments namely, DPSM and CTO were investigated using a case study research methodology to better understand application of WITs and PMS. The study findings indicated that both reform measures were adopted voluntarily by the government of Botswana through DPSM. However, in other ministries and departments across the public service including CTO, the adoption of the schemes was imposed. Regarding implementation of both schemes, structures and process were put in place to guide their success. Various challenges, however, were also identified. For instance, in the case of WITs in both study organisations lack of support for the scheme at senior levels was identified. For PMS, the scheme failed to attract support especially among industrial class employees in DPSM. Despite few systematic evaluation efforts

undertaken, empirical evidence for both PMS and WITs pointed towards improved performance in the two study organisations.

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge and thank the people who have provided guidance, assistance and support over the duration of this thesis.

To my principal supervisor, Professor Mark Bray, I would like to express my sincere gratitude for providing the motivation, confidence and academic direction necessary to bring this project to completion. He was always ready to read (and reread) my drafts at short notice and would provide valuable feedback to help me minimize the stress associated with a project of this magnitude. Professor Mark guided this work and encouraged my independent thinking and, for that, I say thank you so much.

I am also highly indebted to Dr. Johanna Macneil for her encouragement, guidance and support. Her insights helped me to frame my research questions and to shape the thesis. She never failed to share with me insights arising from her research expertise in organisational studies, and from her experience in helping others to undertake research projects.

Of course, without the participation of the interviewees and other individuals this research would have been impossible, and I am appreciative of all those individuals and government officers who gave me their time willingly and freely to answer my questions thoughtfully and constructively. They generously provided internal policy documents and other materials for my scrutiny.

To my colleagues at the University of Newcastle, thank you for offering me support at crucial times. I also wish to acknowledge and thank the University of Botswana – my employers – for sponsoring me to come and do this research.

I dedicate this thesis to my family. My Wife Oneh and son Atang Molefhe your constant support and love inspired me and made the journey worthwhile despite my absence from home. They paid the price for living without me for such a long time. Mr. Selebogo, the insightful discussions we had proved valuable.

Last, this is for my mother Setshego Molefhe – she believed in the value of education.

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	2
1.2 THE TOPIC, ITS IMPORTANCE AND THE MOTIVATION BEHIND THE STUDY	3
1.3 THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE THESIS	8
1.4 METHODOLOGY	10
1.5 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS	11
1.6 CONCLUSION	13
CHAPTER 2	15
2.1 INTRODUCTION	16
2.2 NPM MODEL: DEFINITIONAL ISSUES	17
2.3 NPM IN THE DEVELOPED ECONOMIES	22
2.3.2 Adoption of NPM	25
2.3.3 Implementation of NPM	31
2.3.4 Success of NPM	34
2.4 NPM IN DEVELOPING ECONOMIES	40
2.4.1 Adoption of NPM	40
2.4.2 Implementation of NPM	52
2.4.3 Assessment of results	56
2.5 CONCLUSION	63
CHAPTER 3	65
3.1 INTRODUCTION	66
3.2 METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH	66
3.2.1 Rationale for choice of approach	69
3.3 RESEARCH DESIGN	70
3.3.1 Experimental design	71
3.3.2 Survey design	72
3.3.3 Case study design	74
3.3.4 Suggested research design	77
3.3.5 The Unit of Analysis and Selection of Cases	80
3.3.5.1 Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM)	84
3.3.5.2 Central Transport Organisation (CTO)	88
3.4 DATA GATHERING METHODS	90
3.4.1 Interviews	91
3.4.2 Documentation	93
3.5 DATA ANALYSIS	95
3.6 ETHICS AND QUALITY IN RESEARCH	98
3.6.1 Reflexivity	98
3.6.2 Triangulation	99
3.6.3 Ethical considerations	100
3.7 CONCLUSION	100
CHAPTER 4	102
4.1 INTRODUCTION	103

4.2	THE BRITISH COLONIAL LEGACY (1885 – 1966)	106
4.2.1	<i>Summary</i>	112
4.3	POST-INDEPENDENCE DEVELOPMENTS (1966 – 1980s)	113
4.3.1	<i>Mineral-led Development</i>	117
4.3.2	<i>Role of the State in Development</i>	120
4.3.3	<i>Summary</i>	122
4.4	CONTEMPORARY BOTSWANA DEVELOPMENT AND PUBLIC SECTOR REFORMS (1990s – 2000s)	123
4.4.1	<i>Slowing Economic Growth, ‘Unbalanced Development’ and the Public Sector</i>	123
4.4.2	<i>Emerging Problems in the Public Sector</i>	127
4.4.3	<i>An Overview of Public Sector Reforms</i>	130
4.5	CONCLUSION	139
CHAPTER 5		141
5.1	INTRODUCTION	142
5.2	BOTSWANA PUBLIC SERVICE: AN AFRICAN MODEL?	143
5.2.1	<i>Independence transition and institutional legacies</i>	143
5.2.2	<i>The central administrative arm: Its character</i>	148
5.2.4	<i>Summary</i>	151
5.3	POLICY-MAKING PROCESS IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE	151
5.3.1	<i>Broader Policy Framework: NDPs and Vision 2016</i>	152
5.3.2	<i>Institutional Policy Framework: MFDP and DPSM</i>	157
5.3.3	<i>Other Stakeholders in the Policy Development Process</i>	162
5.3.4	<i>Summary</i>	168
5.4	THE ADOPTION OF NPM REFORMS: 1993 – 2008	168
5.4.2	<i>Adoption of WITs</i>	176
5.4.3	<i>Adoption of PMS</i>	179
5.5	CONCLUSION	181
CHAPTER 6		182
6.1	INTRODUCTION	183
6.2	IMPLEMENTATION OF WORK IMPROVEMENT TEAMS (WITs)	184
6.2.1	<i>General implementation framework</i>	184
6.2.2	<i>Implementation of WITs in CTO</i>	190
6.2.3	<i>Implementation of WITs in DPSM</i>	200
6.2.4	<i>Summary</i>	205
6.3.2	<i>Evaluation of WITs in CTO</i>	208
6.3.3	<i>Evaluation of WITs in DPSM</i>	214
6.3.4	<i>Summary</i>	219
6.4	CONCLUSION	220
7.1	INTRODUCTION	222
7.2	IMPLEMENTATION OF PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM (PMS)	223
7.2.1	<i>General implementation framework</i>	224
7.2.1.1	<i>Link with National Goals</i>	225
7.2.1.2	<i>Phased Implementation</i>	232
7.2.1.3	<i>The Roles of New Stakeholders</i>	235
7.2.2	<i>Implementation of PMS in CTO</i>	238
7.2.3	<i>Implementation of PMS in DPSM</i>	243
7.2.4	<i>Summary</i>	249
7.3	EVALUATION OF PMS	250
7.3.1	<i>Evaluation of PMS in CTO</i>	254

7.3.2	<i>Evaluation of PMS in DPSM</i>	260
7.3.3	<i>Summary</i>	265
7.4	CONCLUSION	266
CHAPTER 8		268
8.1	INTRODUCTION	269
8.2	SUMMARY OF THE KEY FINDINGS	270
8.2.1	<i>Adoption</i>	270
8.2.2	<i>Implementation</i>	273
8.2.3	<i>Evaluation</i>	278
8.3	THE THEORETICAL CONTRIBUTIONS OF THE STUDY	280
8.3.1	<i>Limited focus on developing countries</i>	281
8.3.2	<i>The Holistic Analysis of NPM reforms</i>	284
8.3.3	<i>The Importance of Context</i>	285
8.3.4	<i>Future Research Areas</i>	286
REFERENCES		288
APPENDIX A - INTERVIEW QUESTIONS		327
APPENDIX B: LIST OF INTERVIEWEES		329

Tables and Figures

Tables

Table 2. 1: Pressure for reform by country group	52
Table 2. 2: Relative size and remuneration of civil servants (1995)	60
Table 3. 1: Relevant situations for determining the appropriate type of research design	78
Table 3. 2: DPSM's Number of employees by category of employment	87
Table 3. 3: CTO's Number of employees by category of employment	89
Table 4. 1: GDP growth 1966 – 1989	115
Table 4. 2: Diamond Contribution, 1976 -1989 (In percent of GDP)	119
Table 4. 3: Sectoral Performance, 1991-2000 (In percentage of GDP).....	124
Table 4. 4: Botswana public sector employment (1990-1998) (In thousands)	127
Table 5. 1: State Governance Indicators, Average Global Percentile: 1996 – 2005	150
Table 7. 1: Chronology of PMS implementation and evaluation.....	228

Figures

Figure 2. 1: Local demand and supply in the NPM reform agenda	30
Figure 5. 1: NDP 9 Strategy Map.....	155
Figure 6. 1: WITs implementation framework	185
Figure 7. 1: PMS implementation framework.....	226

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AED	Academy for Educational Development
BDP	Botswana Democratic Party
BIAC	Botswana Institute of Accountancy and Commerce
BIDPA	Botswana Institute for Development Policy Analysis
BNPC	Botswana National Productivity Centre
CTO	Central Transport Organisation
CSR	Civil Service reforms
DCEC	Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime
DPIC	Departmental Productivity Improvement Committee
DPSM	Directorate of Public Sector Management
ECC	Economic Committee of Cabinet
HLCC	High Level Consultative Council
IMF	International Monetary Fund
KPI	Key Performance Indicators
MFDP	Ministry of Finance and Development Planning
MINI PIC-FORCE	Ministerial Productivity Improvement for the Civil Service
NDP	National Development Plan
NPM	New Public Management
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PIC-FORCE	Productivity Improvement Committee for the Civil Service
PMS	Performance Management System
PSRU	Public Service Reforms Unit
SADC	Southern African Development Community
TGLP	Tribal Grazing Land Policy
WITs	Work Improvement Teams
WB	World Bank